



UNIVERSITY OF GUYANA

INSTITUTE OF DEVELOPMENT STUDIES  
FACULTY OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

TEL: 592 222 5409  
FAX NO. 592 222 5551

TURKEYEN CAMPUS,  
BOX 101110, GEORGETOWN,  
GUYANA

OUR REF:  
YOUR REF:

January 28, 2010

Mr Warren Evans  
Director  
Environment Department  
World Bank

[wevans@worldbank.org](mailto:wevans@worldbank.org)

Dear Mr Evans,

According to a local newspaper, the *Kaieteur News (KN)* of January 21, 2010, it would appear that the World Bank is preparing a reply to Guyana's protest over Suriname's use of a map of Suriname that included part of Guyana's territory at an October 2009 meeting of the Participants Committee (PC4) of the Forest Carbon Partnership Facility (FCPF). The *KN* reported Isabel Hagbrink, Senior Communications Officer with the Carbon Finance Unit of the World Bank Group as saying, "Indeed, we have received [the letter of protest from the Government of Guyana] and we are in the process of preparing a reply."

Please be reminded that the letter of protest, signed by Guyana's Minister of Agriculture Mr. Robert Persaud, also asked for the removal of Dr. Janette Bulkan from a technical advisory panel of the FCPF, stating that the country has serious concerns over her ability to be an objective assessor in that body.

We are sure that you recognize that, inasmuch as Mr. Persaud's letter of protest conflated Suriname's effective claim on part of Guyana's territory with an impugning of Dr. Bulkan's professional expertise, objectivity and even her patriotism, the World Bank cannot ignore that these issues are conjoint and inseparable and should be clearly responded to accordingly.

As such, we are obliged to write you as follows:

1. First, we would point out that Dr. Bulkan is a former colleague at the University of Guyana and Head of the Amerindian Research Unit. She is widely considered to be the foremost expert on Guyana's Amerindian studies, sustainable forestry, environmental practices, and related fields.

She has consistently addressed the issue of the role of institutions in countering poor governance and corruption, and as such, has been a close colleague of the Institute of Development Studies (IDS).

Indeed, the World Bank itself a few years ago claimed on its Website that corruption (governance) is the biggest obstacle to development in poor countries. This puts the obligation on the World Bank to be (as well as appear to be) honest to this position. It is in fact an important opinion which undergirds intellectual, analytical and research efforts to promote development in Guyana.

2. We therefore wish to emphasize that any reply by the World Bank that addresses only the matter of the use of a map would be at best a partial reply, and could more correctly be viewed as duplicitous in the sense of putting 'political correctness' before substantive development issues.

Moreover any response that does not address the views expressed by Mr. Persaud on Dr. Bulkan's professional expertise and objectivity would appear disingenuous unless the World Bank sought to have some independent review to determine whether she has indeed been unprofessional in executing her responsibilities in the TAP process. To do otherwise might even be construed as an attempt by the World Bank to interfere in Guyana's domestic political affairs, given that the letter by Mr. Persaud was part of a well-known official campaign against Dr. Bulkan for her independent views.

3. Any failure to give a *total* response to the Government's protest would therefore suggest that the World Bank, which has led other development agencies in recognizing the importance of institutions in development, is prepared to undermine an institutional arrangement that it had itself created. The arrangement we refer to is precisely the TAP review process, which, we thought, would have been insulated from any form of manipulation by potential beneficiaries (in particular the REDD Country and Carbon Fund Participants) of the FCPF mechanisms.
4. Finally, being well aware that it is a relatively easy matter to address the totality of the letter of protest without addressing this issue, we bluntly ask that in your reply you indicate whether you intend to continue using Dr. Bulkan's services in the TAP process beyond the period of her current contract, the letter of protest notwithstanding.

We do this for three reasons: First, Dr. Bulkan has collaborated with the Institute of Development Studies on many important scholarly and public policy initiatives, and we have every confidence in her technical expertise, objectivity, (and her patriotism!); second, we ourselves share many of Dr. Bulkan's concerns about the forest management related issues, the Guyana Government's Low Carbon Development Strategies (LCDS), and particularly the World Bank's REDD Readiness Preparation Processes; and third because we fear that it would be all too easy to explain away any intention/decision to prevent Dr. Bulkan from continuing to

contribute to the TAP process, for example by claiming that the structure of the process has changed, when in point of fact the World Bank is simply acceding to the request by the Government of Guyana for her removal.

For us it is clear that Dr. Bulkan's independent views on Guyana's forestry practices, and her concerns about the officially endorsed LCDS, which are actually quite in the spirit of the FCPF's own Readiness Mechanism, would naturally alarm and provoke the ire of a government seeking funding for its standing forests and exclusive control over monitoring, reporting and verification (MRV) processes.

We request an urgent reply from you on your response to the letter of Minister Persaud, dated 26 November 2009, and a statement on the future composition and role of TAPs in the FCPF.

Sincerely,

Signed by:

Prof. Clive Y. Thomas (Director, on leave)  
Dr. Thomas Singh (Director, ag.)

c.c. Benoit Bosquet, Senior Natural Resources Management Specialist, World Bank, [bbosquet@worldbank.org](mailto:bbosquet@worldbank.org);  
Joelle Chassard, Manager, Carbon Finance Unit, World Bank, [jchassard@worldbank.org](mailto:jchassard@worldbank.org);  
Ken Andrasko, Carbon Finance Unit, World Bank, [kandrasko@worldbank.org](mailto:kandrasko@worldbank.org).